



David M. Davis, M.P.
Member for Southern Metropolitan Region
Shadow Minister for Planning
Shadow Minister for Local Government
Shadow Minister for Equality

8 August 2016

Professor Stuart Macintyre AO
Chair
Heritage Council of Victoria
GPO Box 2392
Melbourne VIC 3001

heritage.council@delwp.vic.gov.au

Dear Professor Macintyre,

Request for interim protection orders for Murrumbeena and Carnegie railway stations

It is the view of the Executive Director, Heritage Victoria that IPOs are not warranted in relation to Murrumbeena and Carnegie railway stations, that while these places are under imminent threat, evidence has not been provided that these places meet the threshold for state level significance.

As an IPO has the effect of including a place or object in the Victorian Heritage Register (VHR) for a period of time while a cultural heritage significance assessment is undertaken, the decision of the Executive Director to not issue IPOs for these places would appear to trigger s.38(1)(b) of the Act: "a recommendation of the Executive Director that a nominated place or object should not be included in the Heritage Register" in relation to which, under 38(1), "Any person may make a written submission to the Heritage Council".

Please take this letter as a submission objecting to the recommendation of the Executive Director, which in turn would appear to trigger s.40 of the Act meaning "a hearing into whether or not the place or object should be included in the Heritage Register will be conducted".

According to the Victorian Heritage Database Report, Murrumbeena railway station with associated gardens is located on Murrumbeena Road, Murrumbeena and was presumably opened with the line on 8th of October, 1877, the present buildings and footbridge having been erected about the time of electrification in 1922. It is historically and aesthetically significant.

It is historically significant (Criterion A) as a point of entry and departure for the Murrumbeena locality for over a century, having been associated with its development presumably since the opening of the line in 1877. It is understood that the platforms are the only surviving nineteenth century elements. It is historically significant also as a surviving complex of standard buildings designed by the office of the chief architect in the Way and Works Branch during J. W. Hardy's term of office but presumably undertaken by his successor, James Fawcett.

It is aesthetically significant (Criterion E) as a complete (Criterion D) suburban station complex from the Great War period with up and downside buildings and footbridge, complemented by mature but remnant public gardens. Their aesthetic importance is derived also from the use of Arts and Crafts forms and ornamentation in a manner which complements many of the contemporary houses in the vicinity of the railway station.

The Carnegie railway station with associated gardens is located on Koornang Road, Carnegie and was presumably opened with the line on the 8th of October, 1877, the present main building and remains of the downside building having been erected at the time of electrification in 1922 when James Fawcett was the chief architect of the Way and Works Department. It is historically and aesthetically significant.

It is historically significant (Criterion A) as a point of entry and departure for the Carnegie locality for over a century, having been associated with its development presumably since the opening of the line in 1877. It is understood that the platforms are the only surviving nineteenth century elements. The main building is historically significant also as a surviving standard structure of its type designed by the office of the chief architect in the Way and Works Branch during J.W. Hardy's term of office but undertaken by his successor, James Fawcett.

It is aesthetically significant (Criterion E) as a surviving suburban station complex from the Great War period with up side building complemented by mature public gardens.

The building's aesthetic importance is derived also from the use of Arts and Crafts forms and ornamentation in a manner which complements many of the contemporary houses in the vicinity of the railway station.

Both stations and surrounding vegetation are included in the City of Glen Eira heritage overlay and both are important in demonstrating a high degree of creative or technical achievement at the particular period of the historically significant electrification of the line (criterion F).

Both stations also have strong or special association with generations of public transport commuters, both locally and further afield (criterion G).

Murrumbeena station in addition has special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons (the Boyd family), of importance in Victoria's history (criterion H).

I make this submission on behalf of my constituents who have been sorely abused by the lack of a proper public planning process in relation to the proposed demolition of their and Victoria's precious cultural heritage. I am convinced that the heritage qualities of these stations are of such significance that the Heritage Council will have no option other than including these stations in the Victorian Heritage Register, although given the proposed construction of elevated viaducts on the Caulfield to Dandenong railway line, perhaps the best outcome that can be achieved is the removal of the station buildings to another location.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'David Davis', with a stylized flourish extending to the left.

The Hon David Davis MP
Member for Southern Metropolitan Region